

The Impact of Coastal Area Development on Fishing Communities in Manado City

Patrick Aldrin Latuni¹, I Wayan Suwena², I Wayan Tagel Eddy³

aldryenlatuni@gmail.com
Udayana University, Denpasar 80114, Indonesia

Abstract

This study investigated the consequences of development on the fishing communities residing along the shores of Manado City. Employing a qualitative research methodology with a postmodernist approach, the research focused on examining the forms of development and their resultant consequences. The findings revealed that the observed development encompassed coastal reclamation and the construction of coastal areas. Furthermore, the effects of reclamation and development have brought about changes in the coastal conditions along with transformations in the livelihoods and economic circumstances of the fishing communities. Ultimately, it can be concluded that the impacts of development stem from coastal reclamation and various forms of evolution in the coastal region, resulting in environmental and social challenges for the fishing communities in Manado City.

Keywords: Development Consequences; Fishing Community; Manado City

1. Introduction

Human life is inseparable from interdependence among individuals and their reliance on the natural environment in which they reside. Basically, humans are created to coexist and form groups known as societies. The Indonesian dictionary provides a definition of society as a group of individuals in the broadest sense, bound together by a shared culture. Similar to any living organism, societies also undergo development. This development encompasses various aspects, including the advancement of time marked by different forms of development, such as the development occurring in the coastal areas of Manado City. Since 1995, Manado City has witnessed various improvements in its coastal regions. These include reclamation projects carried out with the aim of coastal protection against erosion, as well as discussions regarding the full utilization of Manado City's potential. An article published by barta1.com in 2019 noted that the coastal development project in Manado City initially originated as a government discourse, which was then implemented as a realization of that discourse.

Government development projects undergo continuous changes every year, employing reclaimed coastal land as centers of economic and business activities to sustain the regional economy of Manado City. Additionally, the government proclaims that its development priority will not harm various stakeholders, including the fishing communities residing in the coastal areas of Manado City. However, the situation on the ground differs from the government's claims. There is a disparity where fishing communities have to bear the negative impacts of the coastal development in the region. The indications of the impacts experienced by the communities can be seen through the reduction in the number of fishermen in North Sulawesi, as recorded by the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries. The data displays a decrease from 80,096 fishermen in 2010 to 74,982 in 2021. It proves that certain aspects have had adverse effects on the sustainability of the fishing communities in the coastal areas of Manado City. The reduction affects all categories of fishermen, including both traditional and modern fishermen. Traditional fishermen employ traditional methods and are more self-reliant, while modern fishermen are those who utilize larger boats and venture further into the sea. Modern fishermen consist of boat owners and laborers.

The decreased number of fishermen has been studied by various parties, including Wowor et al. (2019), who stated that the expanded reclamation project had the worst indication for the sustainability of the fishing community's livelihoods. It also damages the coastal ecosystem, which in turn affects the fishermen's income. As a result, many of them cannot withstand these disturbances. The management of coastal and marine resources should pay attention to the principles of natural resources, sustainable utilization, and the welfare of the people. The biggest challenge in managing coastal resources is how to supply optimal and sustainable benefits (Danis, 2017:24). However, the on-site phenomenon contradicts these principles, as described in the Mongabay newspaper article in 2020, which clarifies the fate of fishermen in Manado City since the reclamation. The fishermen complain that the reclamation has produced a significant distance between their homes

and the boat mooring areas. They also frequently lose their fishing equipment. Besides reclamation, the coastal area has undergone other forms of development that undoubtedly influence the livelihoods of the fishing communities.

The phenomenon has sparked the author's inquisitiveness in investigating the forms of development and the consequences of development on the fishing communities along the coast of Manado City. These research objectives are crucial since not all government regulations have a positive impact on the community. To address these issues, the author utilizes Pierre Bourdieu's theory of social practice, which concentrates on habitus, field, and capital as factors influencing the social practices within a community. Habitus refers to the internalized social structures acquired through life experiences and connections to the capital. Capital represents the resources or forms of power possessed by individuals, which are then combined with the field or arena, the space or location where social actors compete for material products. By considering habitus, capital, and field, the theory sheds light on the social practices of individuals or communities. Bourdieu's theory, expressed as $(\text{Habitus} \times \text{Capital}) + \neg\text{Field} = \text{Social Practice}$ (Ritzer and Goodman, 2010:524—526), is highly applicable in addressing the research objectives formulated.

2. Research Method

This study employs a qualitative methodology with a postmodernist approach, qualifying for an investigation of the social construction of truth. To address the research questions, primary and secondary data are collected from the research site, which includes the villages of Sindulang, Karangria, and Tumumpa in Manado City. The data collection methods involve observation, interviews, and document analysis. The collected data are then carefully selected and analyzed to focus on the relevant elements of the research problem. The upshots of the data analysis are presented in a descriptive format to enhance understanding. The final stage of the research involves drawing conclusions based on the findings and data obtained from the field. It is worth noting that these conclusions offer new insights and contribute to the existing body of knowledge.

3. Result and Discussion

a. Reclamation of Manado Coastal Area

Reclamation is a process that involves converting previously submerged or water-covered areas into usable land for various intents. In the case of Manado's coastal area, the government has launched reclamation projects to harness its potential for economic and developmental aims. According to Geotimes 2016, the discourse on coastal development in Manado has been ongoing since 1995, with the initial objective of protecting the coastal region from erosion. However, the perspective of the local fishing communities regarding these reclamation activities varies significantly. They vehemently resist the reclamation of the coastal area, reflecting an internal conflict experienced by the fishing communities due to this transformation. Interviews conducted by the author revealed that the fishing communities have consistently expressed their resistance to the coastal reclamation process.

Regrettably, they lack the means to effectively convey their concerns and aspirations to the authorities. Their primary contention is that the changes brought about by the reclamation and development initiatives in the Manado coastal area have resulted in more significant disadvantages than benefits for their livelihoods. The alteration of the coastal landscape due to reclamation, coupled with the government's economic interests in exploiting the coastal resources, has led to the displacement of the original inhabitants, particularly the fishermen, from their ancestral villages. Their traditional coastal dwellings are no longer viable for maintaining their fishing profession. Consequently, the fishermen are confronted with the daunting challenge of supplying for their families and meeting their basic needs, exacerbating the prevalent issue of poverty within the affected communities.

b. Dependence of the Community and the impact of Coastal Environmental Changes

Fishing communities heavily rely on marine resources as their primary source of livelihood. Any alterations in climate patterns or oceanic conditions can significantly affect the productivity of coastal ecosystems, consequently impacting the lives of fishing communities. It holds for the fishing communities along the coast of Manado. An article published in Kompas newspaper in 2021 sheds light on the challenges faced by these communities. According to one interviewed fisherman, they feel powerless in the face of ongoing development initiatives by the government, as their concerns and objections seem to go unheard. However, they depict the desire for the government to consider post-reclamation environmental conditions. It is imperative to note that several coastal areas have experienced sedimentation and other environmental changes as a direct consequence of reclamation projects.

Furthermore, coastal regions serve as crucial habitats and activity centers for traditional fishing practices. Nevertheless, the impacts of reclamation and development have transformed these once-vibrant areas into unsuitable and challenging environments for fishermen. The increasing public accessibility resulting from these development projects has led to frequent incidents of fishing equipment damage and loss. It is disheartening to recognize that the main drivers of these issues stem from the very development initiatives that were meant to enhance the region. Therefore, urgent and comprehensive mitigation measures must be implemented to safeguard the rights and livelihoods of these traditional fishing communities.

c. Poverty Impact

The manifestation of poverty is starkly evident among the populace residing in both rural and urban regions. Among these communities, the fishing populace represents one of the numerous groups inhabiting coastal areas. Their occupational identity as fishermen is consistently associated with societal marginalization. The prevailing poverty within coastal communities, particularly among fishermen, is predominantly attributed to complex economic factors. According to Kusnadi (2009), the entrapment of coastal communities in impoverished conditions arises from multifaceted determinants. It can be attributed to the composition of coastal communities, which comprise fishermen and aquaculture practitioners who are generally classified as economically disadvantaged (Tamboto and Manongko, 2019).

Among the underlying causes of poverty are limited land ownership and capital, inadequate infrastructure and facilities, misdirected developmental initiatives, disparities in human resources, and excessive exploitation of natural resources. As previously elucidated, some fishermen have resorted to selling their land and relocating without considering how they will sustain their livelihoods with their existing skills. Suparlan (1984), as cited by Asyifani et al. (2021), posits that a characteristic of poverty is the inability of individuals to meet their basic needs for food, clothing, and shelter due to low-income levels. In brief, poverty is defined as a state of low living standards or insufficient material resources among a group of individuals compared to the prevailing societal norms (Asyifani et al., 2021).

Moreover, the constrained resources in the research location, particularly in the coastal area of Manado City, where the fishing communities reside, are closely associated with coastal development. It has significantly hindered the fishermen's ability to fully utilize their capabilities as fishermen due to the diminishing access to vital resources and infrastructure, which serve as their primary sources of income. Additionally, the advent of development initiatives in the area has resulted in a disparity in human resources. The rapid acceleration of modernization has marginalized the fishing communities, as an influx of migrants with superior human resources in terms of economic and educational aspects has arrived. Consequently, the fishing communities have become increasingly vulnerable to poverty.

d. The Diverted Career of Fishing Community

Career transition is a process or effort undertaken to meet one's needs through alternative forms of income. The impetus for career transitions often stems from external factors, as seen in the fishing communities of Manado City. When development affects their status and career as fishermen, they proactively anticipate the consequent impacts by engaging in career transitions. The fishermen of Manado City must maximize their potential to meet household needs, and one way they accomplish this is through career transitions. Consequently, the fishing communities in Manado City have expanded their professional engagements beyond solely being fishermen. These include establishing small shops selling daily necessities and retailing gasoline, and even working as construction workers. This phenomenon can be observed in the research location, where the fishing communities have ventured outside their habitual occupation. Such diversification is a response to the impact of development on their daily income. However, it is necessary to note that the coastal fishing communities in Manado City lack the inherent skills and capital required for these alternative professions.

Bourdieu's theory on social practice, represented by the formula $(\text{Habitus} \times \text{Capital}) + \text{Field} = \text{Social practice}$, provides a profound understanding of how the habitus and capital of a society influence social practices. This theory proposes valuable insights into the career transition process among fishing communities (Ritzer and Goodman, 2010:524—526). The habitus of the fishing communities in Manado City, rooted in a complex interplay of social, cultural, and economic factors, has evolved over generations. It is shaped by a continuous cycle of learning, upbringing, and social interactions within the family and the larger community. The fishing communities' habitus begins during childhood, as they observe and learn from the activities and behaviors of their parents. These observations play a crucial role in shaping their perceptions, skills, and attitudes toward various professions and modes of livelihood. The habitus, in conjunction with available capital and the specific field of engagement, ultimately shapes the social practices of the fishing communities, including their decisions to transition to alternative professions in response to the consequence of development on their livelihoods. Fixing damaged fishing nets and preparing equipment, parents consciously transmit theoretical and practical

knowledge to their children regarding the dos and don'ts of fishing. The formation of habitus among the fishing communities in Manado City also stems from the community's introduction to the fishing practice.

The upbringing of children within the coastal areas, where the fishing communities reside, is characterized by a long-standing tradition of cooperation. Upon returning from the sea, community members actively participate in assisting with the maintenance of equipment and the docking of fishermen's boats. The children are actively involved in these chores from an early age, contributing to the formation of their habitus through both personal experiences and the communal guidance they receive. In addition to habitus, the capital presence also significantly influences the livelihoods of the fishing communities. On the other hand, capital plays a pivotal role in maintaining dominance and power. The fishing communities in Manado City possess limited capital and are further hindered by a lack of strong cultural capital due to intellectual limitations. However, economic pressures arising from land reclamation and development have compelled some to explore alternative paths through career transitions. For instance, several fishing community members have chosen to sell their coastal residences and start anew in distinct locations with different professions. Meanwhile, others have adapted by engaging in trade to meet their needs.

e. Migration of Fisherman

Migration refers to the population or group moving from one location to another. This phenomenon is influenced by a range of factors, including economic, social, political, and environmental considerations. Common motivations for migration include the pursuit of better employment opportunities, avoidance of conflicts, and the search for safe and healthy environments. Conversely, migration can also be triggered by issues, such as marginalization, discrimination, and conflicts resulting from government policies, which significantly affect the communities. In line with the concept of migration, the indigenous fishing community of Borgo along the coastal areas of Manado City experiences identical circumstances. In this context, the development activities in the coastal regions have compelled some community members to relocate to more favorable areas. Additionally, the pressures and social discrimination faced by fishermen further contribute to their decision to migrate. Based on a comprehensive analysis of documentary evidence, the study reveals clear migration patterns among the fishing communities.

Based on the previous research conducted by Mawikere and Wowor (2014) on the historical development of coastal settlements in Manado City, it was discovered, as quoted, "For fishermen residing in the southern coastal areas of Manado City, Pondol, Titiwungen, and Sario were chosen as migration destinations, while for fishermen in the northern coastal areas of Manado City, Karangria, Sindulang, and Tumumpa tended to have migrated towards Molas and Meras, which are still part of the coastal regions of Manado City" (Mawikere & Wowor, 2014: 37). Furthermore, it is evident that in the current time, fishing settlements have not only shifted but also evaporated on their own (Mawikere & Wowor, 2014: 37). In line with these findings, many fishermen have experienced the results of development and chosen to migrate to new residential areas. This phenomenon aligns with the observations and interviews conducted by the author with several fishermen at the research site and represents one of their strategies to cope with economic pressures.

4. Conclusion

Fishing is a predominant profession among the population majority in Indonesia, given the country's status as the largest archipelago. Therefore, all elements linked to the development process of a region, especially coastal areas, should take into account the fishing communities as a crucial consideration. Development efforts should always be guided by regulations that prioritize the interests and welfare of the people. Consequently, investigating the impacts of coastal development can serve as valuable input for policymakers and the government to assess the changing environmental conditions resulting from development and reclamation processes in coastal areas, particularly in Manado City. Furthermore, it is crucial to consider the consequences of such development on the coastal communities. Providing practical solutions, rather than mere rhetoric, to address the challenges arising from the development impacts, such as poverty among fishing communities, can support these individuals to return to their original work in alignment with their habitus. Besides, the government should prioritize the well-being of fishing communities, as they are directly affected by every government initiative or discourse.

5. References

- Afrizal. 2014. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Sebuah Upaya Mendukung Penggunaa Penelitian Kualitatif dalam Berbagai Disiplin Ilmu*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Barker, C. 2011. *Cultural Studies: Teori dan Praktik, Culture and Cultural Studies*. Bantul: Kreasi Wacana.

- Asyifani, K. 2021. Solidaritas Sosial dalam Marginalisasi Masyarakat Miskin (Studi di Dusun Kentheng Kota Surakarta). *DIMENSIA: Jurnal Kajian Sosiologi*, 10(1), 61–75. <https://doi.org/10.21831/dimensia.v10i1.41052>
- Daris. L. 2017. *Dinamika Sosial Masyarakat Pesisir*. Yogyakarta: Leutikaprio
- Hardani., Andriani, H., Ustiawaty, J., Utami, E. F., Istiqomah, R. R., Fardani, R. A., Suk,ama, D. J., & Auliya, N. H. 2020. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif dan Kuantitatif*. Yogyakarta: CV. Pustaka Ilmu Group.
- Koentjaraningrat. 1987. *Pengantar Teori Antropologi I*. Jakarta: UI-Press.
- . 1990. *Sejarah Teori Antropologi II*. Jakarta: UI-Press.
- . 1994. *Metode-Metode Penelitian Masyarakat III*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Kusnadi. 2020. *Konflik Sosial Masyarakat Nelayan Kemiskinan dan Perebutan Sumber Daya Perikanan*. Yogyakarta: LKis.
- Mawikere, F. R., & Wowor, M., 2014. Kajian Historis Pemukiman Di Sekitar Pantai Manado. *Jurnal LPPM Bidang EkoSosBudKum*, 1(2), 37.
- Mohammad, Y. A. 2018. *Perubahan Sosial dan Pembangunan*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- Moleong, L. J. 2002. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif Edisi Revisi*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Tahun 2007. *Undang-Undang Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 27, Tahun 2007 tentang Pengelolaan Wilayah Pesisir dan Pulau-Pulau Kecil*. Lembaran lepas UU Nomor 1 Tahun 2014.pdf (peraturan.go.id) [diakses tanggal 24 Maret 2022].
- Ratna, N. K. 2010. *Metodologi Penelitian Kajian Budaya dan Ilmu Sosial Humaniora pada Umumnya*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Ritzer, G., & Goodman, D. J. 2005. *Teori Sosiologi*. Bantul: Kreasi Wacana.
- Sugiyono, D. 2013. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan Tindakan*. Bandung: ALFABETA.
- Tamboto H., & Manonglo A., 2019. *Model Pengentasan Kemiskinan Masyarakat Pesisir Berbasis Literasi Ekonomi dan Modal Sosial*. Malang: CV. Seribu Bintang
- Wowor, C., Dengo, S., & Londa, V. 2019. Dampak Kebijakan Reklamasi Pantai Boulevard pada Masyarakat Nelayan Kecamatan Sario Kota Manado. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 5(77).