

The Effect of Movie Subtitle on Tenth Grade Students' Speaking Skill 73

Nabila Zustira¹; Lulus Irawati²

nabilazustira@gmail.com¹; lulusirawati@unipma.ac.id²
Udayana University, Jl. Raya Kampus Unud Jimbaran, 80361, Indonesia¹
PGRI University Madiun, Jl. Setia Budi, 63118, Indonesia²

Abstract

This research aims to investigate the effect of watching the movie with subtitles and without subtitles on speaking skills for the tenth grade in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Madiun. The experimental research conducted by using quasi-experimental design. The students in experimental group given the treatment by using movies with subtitles, and the students in control group watched movies without subtitles. This research is using random sampling technique. There are 12 participants from each experimental and control group. The students given some questions based on the movie in their pre-test and post-test. All students took the speaking post-test at the end of the study. The descriptive statistics and independent t-test used to analyze the data. The study's findings show that students in the experimental group who were taught the movie with subtitles performed significantly better than students who were taught movies without subtitles. Finally, the research findings suggest that using movie subtitles can have a positive effect on students' speaking skill. It proven by research findings that students who taught using movie subtitles perform better than students who taught without subtitles. As a result, English teachers advised to use movie subtitles as a medium in speaking activities.

Keywords: movie, movie subtitle, speaking skill

1. Introduction

The most crucial ability for basic and general human connection is speaking. Speaking should be taught and practiced in the classroom, with the general understanding that the goal of English courses is enable students to communicate in English. Since not all students can speak English accurately and fluently, many students find it difficult to speak in speaking classes. According to (Cahyono, B. Y, and Widyati, 2011), the problem of Indonesian EFL learners' speaking performance stems not only from linguistic and personality factors but also from the types of classroom tasks assigned by teachers. It can be concluded that teachers must maintain good interaction with their students to develop classroom activities that improve student interaction.

One of the tasks in oral production that involves a significant level of interaction is the interview. According to (Brown, 2007), the interview process consists of the test administrator asking questions to the interviewer, which may be tape-recorded for re-listening, and the interviewer being scored on one or more parameters such as accuracy in pronunciation or grammar, vocabulary, fluency, sociolinguistic/pragmatic appropriateness, task accomplishment, and even comprehension.

Many researchers examined effective media for teaching English. Indonesian teachers try to use different media to facilitate learning especially for increasing speaking skills in the classroom. It teaches students to communicate confidently and fluently in English. Using audiovisual media, particularly movies, is one way to pique students' interest in speaking.

Movies are an effective medium for improving the speaking abilities of English students in the classroom. Using subtitles as pedagogical tools can help students understand the movie's dialogue better. (Khan, 2015) believes that "visuality" in movies can facilitate language learners' comprehension and

understanding by interpreting language in a complete visual context, making it an effective language teaching tool. It is possible to conclude that movies can help learners learn better by interpreting language and can be effective in the teaching and learning process.

Speaking proficiency needs a procedure and process for students to establish standards of assessing speaking. According to (Cahyono, B. Y, and Widyati, 2011), the standard for ensuring students' good command of English includes what function of language the students should master and what type of evaluation should be used to assess students' speaking proficiency. Furthermore, according to (Luoma, 2004), the activities for assessing speaking lead to the planning and development stage during the process, where the developers deduce exactly what needs to be assessed, when developed by trying out and revising tasks, and then rating the criteria and administration procedures for implementing the performance process. Both statements imply that assessing speaking requires a performance process and standards to ensure students have mastered their speaking skills.

Many researchers believe that students can improve their language skills by using movies as learning materials. According to (Laelasari et al., 2019), Students' speaking skills can be influenced by watching English movies with subtitles in pronunciation, vocabulary, grammar, fluency, and comprehension.

2. Literature Review

The related studies on the benefits of subtitled movies in EFL classrooms. According to (Valizadeh, 2021) one group of researchers prefers L2 subtitled films, the other prefers L1 subtitled films. Movies with subtitles This study investigated the effect of L1 and L2 subtitled films on the Language learners' comprehension and discussion of films "hybrid" method research design employed. Three participant groups (60 pre-intermediate learners) were exposed to three different types of subtitles: L1 (Turkish), L2 (English), and standard (no subtitles). Subtitles). The information was gathered using comprehension tests created by the researchers, as well as a semi-structured interview checklist. The results of ANOVA tests L1 subtitled movies were more effective than L2 subtitled movies, which more effective than original movies. Thematic analysis of the interviews revealed that participants found subtitled films to be interesting, motivating, and authentic. Finally, subtitled films can act as mediators and facilitators. EFL teachers and students can practically imply outcomes.

The influence of using movie with subtitles increase their speaking skill. According to(Laelasari et al., 2019), The study was conducted in the odd semester of the academic year 2018/2019 at the first-grade level, precisely X science 1. Following the pretest, the experimental class was given treatment in the form of learning English for holiday planning material by watching English movies with subtitles and held four meetings. The findings show that: (1) watching an English movie with subtitles can improve students' speaking skills; and (2) students' speaking skills in areas such as pronunciation, vocabulary, grammar, fluency, and comprehension improved. The study was conducted in the odd semester of the academic year 2018/2019 at the first-grade level, precisely X science 1. There is an increase from one meeting to the next based on the results of student observation sheets, and from questionnaire data processing, it can be concluded that students provide positive responses to the method the researchers use in learning English, which is a method of watching English movies with subtitles and giving a good response to the teacher.

Teaching students to speak English by using movie subtitles can help them improve their skills. According to (Megawati & Nuroh, 2018)), This study examined the effect of using English subtitles in the movie "Zootopia" as media on the speaking skills of SMPN 6 Sidoarjo. English subtitles are practice media that students can use to help them understand how to watch movies. Quasi Experimental Design was used in the method. The findings of this study indicated that students could improve their speaking skills by using English subtitles. The T-test formula was used to analyze the data obtained from both the pre-test and post-

test scores. The calculation revealed that at 5% significance, the value of t-test (t_o) is greater than t-table (t_t) ($19.90 > 1.99$). According to the test criteria, the results revealed that there is an effect of students' speaking skills when using English subtitles. It can be concluded that using the movie "Zootopia" as a medium to improve students' speaking skills in the ninth grade at SMPN 6 Sidoarjo is an effective and applicable approach.

The effect of subtitles video improve students accuracy in speaking. According to (Tajgozari, 2019), The current study sought to determine the impact of watching captioned television series on the speaking accuracy of an Iranian advanced English as a Foreign Language (EFL) learner. Using the Oxford Placement Test, 66 advanced students were chosen from a pool of 104. The participants were divided into three groups, one control and two experimental, each with 22 students. One group watched the series with English subtitles, another with Persian subtitles, and the control group (CG) watched the same series without any subtitles. The results showed that both English and Persian subtitling improved the accuracy of Iranian advanced English learners. Furthermore, while oral accuracy did not change significantly in the CG, there were significant improvements in the English subtitle and Persian subtitle groups. Furthermore, the study has implications and insights for EFL/English as a second language teachers and curriculum designers.

Movie subtitles as media in English make students enthusiastic in the teaching process. Movie subtitles as a media in English make students enthusiastic in the teaching process (Kusumawati, 2018), This study focuses on the impact of English movies with subtitles on content comprehension and vocabulary comprehension. Fifty-six (56) students from Politeknik Elektronika Negeri Surabaya were choose at random for the English subject. The quasi-experimental were study, a film "Transcendence", it was chosen based on its ESP content and language level difficulty. Group A and group B were the two intact groups. They watched the same movie, but class A saw it with English subtitles, and the class B did not. Following the viewing of the film, participants responded to multiple-choice vocabulary, content comprehension, and questioners. Both groups were enthusiastic about the movie as a medium for vocabulary comprehension. Both groups have made significant progress in terms of movie vocabulary.

Movies in language teaching can be beneficial and can help students improve their oral language skills, however, teachers must carefully plan specific procedure activities. According to (Li & Wang, 2015), there are four steps to designing a class that will use a movie as media. Preparation: The teacher must prepare relevant information such as movie-related words and images, cultural background, character introduction, story outline, and so on. Before watching the movie, teachers should introduce students to movie-related information such as background, history, location, and main character profiles for students to grasp the story's outline, then give some clues about the content which they should pay attention. Allow students to watch the entire movie for the first time to fully comprehend the content. After watching, teachers should create some colorful classroom activities to pique students' interest in participating in classroom discussions and applying what they have learned.

The purpose of this media is to investigate the effectiveness of movie subtitles in improving speaking ability. This research will be conducted in English for tenth grade students at MAN 1 MADIUN. This research helps students learn how to speak with proper pronunciation. The students can completely follow the steps such as preparation, before watching, during watching, and after watching, all of which can help the students focus on speaking English well. Furthermore, purpose of this article is to determine whether students who watch with movie subtitles perform better in speaking than watch with movie without subtitles.

3. Method

This study is being conducted at the senior high school level for students in the tenth grade at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Madiun, East Java, Indonesia. All tenth grade students in this school are the population that is used to classify the students as participants. The purpose of this study is to look into the effect of using movie subtitles on speaking ability.

The experimental study includes all participants in order to determine individual differences in speaking ability. This experimental study attempted to examine whether students watch with movie subtitles outperformed watch without subtitles. The following is an example of the design:

Table I
Experimental Design

Experimental Group	Pre-test	Treatment	Post-test
Control Group	Pre-test	X	Post-test

This research is used Quasi Experimental design because this design have control group, but cannot be functioned optimally for controlled other variabels which influence the implementation. There are 12 students in the experimental group and 12 students in the control group. The participants are from tenth grade of senior high school at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Madiun. this research there are two samples based on sampling technique, class X MIA 1 is control class and class X MIA 2 is experimental class.

The steps of teaching in experimental group or in treatment class can be divided into three activities there are opening, whilst, and closing activity. The purpose of the opening activity is to pique the students' interest in participating in the teaching and learning process. The whilst activity is divided into four steps. First is preparation, teacher needs to prepare the relevant information such as character introduction, the outline of the story, wonderful dialogue etc. Second is before watching the movie give some clues about the content where they should pay attention and let the students to watch movies with problems, they will focus on the movies and find clues to the related problem. Third is during watching, Let the students to watch the whole movie for the first time to understand the movie content. After the first time, teachers can find classic clips as speaking material to watch repeatedly, then let the students imitate or dictate about the dialogue at a moderate speed so that the students learn the language efficiently. Fourth, after watching, teachers should create some colorful classroom activities to pique students' interest in participating in classroom discussions and applying what they have learned.

In this study, a speaking test used to collect data. In this study, the indicator of the speaking score is the students' ability to answer questions based on the movie. If the students are unable to answer the question, they do not speak. During this time, the students asked to respond orally based on the movie shown. The expert-recommended scale used to score the students' speaking. The scoring is based on indicators of oral proficiency such as grammar, vocabulary, comprehension, fluency, pronunciation, and task.

In the experimental and control groups, students asked to answer questions based on the movie. The test carried out before the main study in this research. The speaking test validated, and the reliability indexes obtained were 0.82 and 0.78. As a result, this instrument was used in the primary research study. The students are then given the speaking test as a pre and post-test. The researcher collects data on her own and delivers the speaking test instrument.

Pre and post tests are given to both the experimental and control groups. The pre-test used to determine the homogeneity of both groups. It used to assess students' abilities. Following the pre-test, the experimental group receives the treatment with movie subtitles, while the control group receives the treatment without

subtitles. The students are shown a video about narrative text during the treatment. The students watched the movie for about 7 minutes in two sessions, and then the researcher asked them questions about it.

The experimental group watched "The Greatest Treasure," while the control group watched "Jack and the Beanstalk." Students must answer five questions in order to receive a score. Based on the scoring rubric, the answers recorded and score assigned. A post-test is also administered following treatment to determine whether or not the treatment was effective. Both groups that designed the same instrument as the pre test were given a post test.

The data collected will be analyzed used SPSS 25 computed for the pre test and post test scores both groups. This test is to find out the significant different ability between the experimental and control groups prior to instruction. An independent sample T-test measured to compare the main scores of the control and experimental groups on the posttest and analyzed the means of the two groups in their speaking score by using movie subtitle in experimental group and movie without subtitle in control group.

4. Findings

This section provides the result of the research. Before the treatment is given to the experimental group the students given a pre-test. The pre-test is given to the groups to see whether both of the groups in this research are homogenous. In table 2 shows that the result of the pre-test from both of the groups is homogenous.

Table 2
Descriptive Statistics pre-test of experimental and control group

Group Statistics						
Kelompok		N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Mean	Error
Pretest	Experimental	12	49.08	3.872	1.118	
	Control	12	45.42	1.975	.570	

Table 2 shows descriptive statistics in both of the groups before the research begins. As shown in table 2, the mean of the experimental group using movies with subtitles is 49.08 and the control group watching movies without subtitles is 45.42. To show that both the group are homogenous, an independent sample t-test measured in following table 3.

Table3
Independent sample T-test (Pre-test of Experimental and control group)

Independent Samples Test

Levene's Test for Equality of Variances t-test for Equality of Means

		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
									Lower	Upper
Pretest	Equal variances assumed	2.288	.145	2.922	22	.008	3.667	1.255	1.064	6.269

Equal variances not assumed	2.922	16.362	.010	3.667	1.255	1.011	6.322
--------------------------------------	-------	--------	------	-------	-------	-------	-------

The homogeneity of the speaking test can be seen from the Equality of Variances which shows that the data are homogenous, it is looking from the p-value is 145 which exceeds the level significance is 5. This means the variances are similar the data are homogenous.

To know the significant difference between both groups, it is needed to present the descriptive statistics of the post-test both group and independent-sample t-test from both groups. After the experimental group is given the treatment watches the movie with subtitles and the control group watches the movie without subtitles. It shows a significant difference between the students by using movie subtitles and students who taught without movie subtitles.

Table 4
Descriptive Statistics pre-test of experimental and control group

Group Statistics					
	GROUP	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Posttest	Experimental	12	78.42	2.778	.802
	Control	12	72.33	1.371	.396

Table 4 above shows descriptive statistics from both of the groups after the treatment was done, in the experimental group. As shown in table 4, the mean of the experimental group watching the movie with subtitles is 78.42, and the control group watching the movie without subtitles showed a significant difference between the two groups after the treatment. It can be shown that the students who taught by watching the movie with subtitles have better speaking than the students who taught by using without subtitles. Then, to know whether the movie with subtitles has a significant effect, an independent sample t-test was measured as presented in table 5. Table 5 presents that there is a significant effect that the students who are taught by using movie subtitles have better speaking.

Table 5
Independent sample T-test (Pre-test of Experimental and control group)

Independent Samples Test									
Levene's Test for Equality of Variances					t-test for Equality of Means				
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference Lower Upper
Posttest	Equal variances assumed	3.475	.076	6.802	22	.000	6.083	.894	4.229 7.938
	Equal			6.802	16.055	.000	6.083	.894	4.188 7.979

variances
not
assumed

From the table above it shows in the Sig. (2 tailed) from t-test for equality of means. The result above shows the probability that the result due to sampling error is .000. This value is below the level of sampling error is .05. This means that H0 can be rejected and H1 is accepted. Thus, the difference between means from both of the groups is significantly different.

5. Discussion

This section involves discussion of the result and finding presented in the result description of the treatment in order to provide answer to the research question and to reject or accept the null hypothesis which introduced in chapter one. First, it is necessary to review the research question once again:

Do the students who taught by using English movie subtitle have better in the speaking skill than the students who are taught English movie without subtitle in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Madiun?

Based on the result, there are two main discussions about pre-test and post test. Moreover, this presents the implication and reasons the use of movie subtitle to improve the speaking ability for the tenth grade in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Madiun.

The pre-test results show that both study groups are not significantly different. The pre-test is analyzed using descriptive statistics for both group and the independent sample t-test. It is clear from the pre-test that both groups are homogeneous. The two means scores of the groups, which are not significantly different, demonstrate this. The experimental group's mean score is 49.08, while the control group's mean score is 45.42. Furthermore, the manipulative independent sample t-test demonstrates the result of the assumed equal variances based on Lavene's test for equality of variances of Sig. (.145) where the level of significance is .05. This means that H0 cannot be rejected because the two groups are not significantly different.

The post-test results show that the two study groups are significantly different. The post-test is analyzed using descriptive statistics for both groups and an independent T-test. The post-test is given to the students after they have received treatment. The post-test results show that in the experimental group, movie subtitles are an effective media for speaking skill and can improve the students' speaking score. Students in the experimental group who are taught using movie subtitles have a higher Mean score than students in the control group who are taught using movie without subtitles. The experimental group's mean score is 78.42, while the control group's mean score is 72.33.

The students who are watching movie with subtitle is not only watching and listening to the audiovisual material, but also must know the translate source text into the target language. While watching the movie subtitle, students make less effort to understand the subtitles although the researcher have wrote some vocabularies on their papers.

Movie subtitles are an effective media for teaching English if the activity is designed by the teacher during the teaching and learning process. According to (Li & Wang, 2015), the teacher must prepare relevant information such as movie-related words and pictures, cultural background, character introduction, story outline, dialogue, and so on. Allow students to watch movies with problems before watching movies, students will focus on the movies and look for clues to the related problem, making it easier for students to grasp the key. Allow the students to imitate or dictate about the dialogue while watching the movie at a moderate speed so that the students learn the language efficiently. Following the viewing, the teacher will devise some activities to improve the students' comprehension of the film.

Movie subtitles are effective if students understand that they are not only watching but also learning about the movie. As a result, before the teaching and learning process, the researcher instructs the students to prepare their answers for the interview. The majority of students prepare their responses to retell the movie using their own words. They still read their notes during the pre-test, but I ask them to memorize them for the post-test. As a result, the post-test results show a significant difference in their speaking ability.

According to the preceding statement (Valizadeh, 2021) watching a movie with subtitles is beneficial because it helps students understand the movie better and has a positive impact on their speaking ability. It implies that movie subtitles are an effective medium that can be used in future speaking activities. It is evident from the students' speaking scores, which differ significantly between the pre-test and post-test.

Movie are authentic materials that can help students improve their skills. According to (Wamnebo; Hanapi, 2018) Students in SMA Negeri 1 Namlea's class X IPA2 improve their understanding of describing someone, place, and thing in descriptive text using video because this method will allow you to improve the speaking skills and speak about the descriptive text.

The findings of this study are consistent with those (Valizadeh, 2021), The results show that language learners who watched American TV series with subtitles (L1 Turkish, L2 English) outperformed language learners who watched movies without subtitles. In line with

The findings of this study contrast with those of (Kusumawati, 2018), who investigated impact of movie with subtitles in Politeknik Elektronika Negeri Surabaya. Students in SMA Negeri 1 Namlea's class X IPA2 improve their understanding of describing someone, place, and thing in descriptive text using video because it will allow them to improve their speaking skills and speak about the descriptive text.. Furthermore, (Anugrah, 2021), The students at Senior High School Pekanbaru have excellent speaking skills, with a mean score of 84.05 3. But, there is no statistically significant relationship between the students' habit of watching English movies with English subtitles and their speaking ability at SMAN 5 Pekanbaru.

To summarize, while some researchers failed to find a significant difference between the pre-test and post-test, movies with English subtitles are effective in improving students' speaking ability and assisting students in remembering and comprehending the meaning of these words.

6. Conclusion

This article examines the impact of movie subtitles on senior high school students' speaking abilities. Movie subtitles are useful in public speaking. Students who are taught with movie subtitles perform better in terms of speaking ability than students who are taught without subtitles. The reason that movie subtitles are effective media in improving speaking skills is that watching movies is very effective for learning language, stimulating students' creativity in the teaching and learning process, and helping students concentrate with subtitles in the detail language. It implies that movie subtitles have a significant influence on speaking.

This article demonstrates the limitations for future research in preparing the selected movie and designing the class to keep students focused on watching the movie. Furthermore, the researcher anticipates that the other will be able to develop the research and conduct the other research for other skills such as vocabulary, listening, and reading.

References

- Anugrah, F. . (2021). The Correlation Between Students' Habit in Watching English Movie With English Subtitle and Their Speaking Skill at State Senior High School 5 Pekanbaru. Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau.

- Brown, H. D. (2007). Principles and Language Learning and Teaching (Fourth Edition) (Fourth Edi). Addison

- Wesley Longman.
- Cahyono, B. Y, and Widyati, U. (2011). Teaching of English as a Foreign Language in Indonesia (Malang). University of Malang Press.
- Khan, A. (2015). Using films in the ESL classroom to improve communication skills of non-native learners. *ELT Voices*, 5(4), 46–52.
- Kusumawati, E. (2018). the Effect of Watching English Movies With Subtitles on Esp. Science, Engineering, Education, and Development Studies (SEEDs), 2(2), 139–150.
- Laelasari, T. J., Yulianto, S. W., & Sibarani, J. (2019). The Influence of Watching English Movie by Using Subtittle Toward Students’ Speaking Skill. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pendidikan Universitas Subang (SENDINUSA)*, 1(1), 123–129.
- Li, X., & Wang, P. (2015). A Research on Using English Movies to Improve Chinese College Students’ Oral English. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 5(5), 1096. <https://doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0505.26>
- Luoma, S. (2004). *Assassing Speaking* (Fifth Edit). Cambridge University Press.
- Megawati, F., & Nuroh, E. Z. (2018). the Effect of English Subtitle in “Zootopia” Movie in Speaking Skill. *Jo-ELT (Journal of English Language Teaching) Fakultas Pendidikan Bahasa & Seni Prodi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris IKIP*, 5(2), 94. <https://doi.org/10.33394/jo-elt.v5i2.2307>
- Tajgozari, M. (2019). The effect of watching captioned TV series on speaking accuracy of Iranian advanced EFL learners. *Global Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 9(3), 157–166. <https://doi.org/10.18844/gjflt.v9i3.4221>
- Valizadeh, M. (2021). Effects of L1 and L2 Subtitled English Movies on Pre-Intermediate Learners’ Comprehension and Speaking Abilities. *Theresa Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 7(2).
- Wamnebo; Hanapi. (2018). Students’ Speaking Skill in Oral Descriptive Text by Using Video at Tenth Grade in SMA Negeri 1 Namlea. *Jurnal Jupiter*, 16(2).