

German and Indonesian Educational Concepts: An Early Comparative Study

Refnywidialistuti^a, Azwar Ananda^b, Nurhizrah Gistituati^c, Rusdinal^{d*}

^a refnywidialistuti@unespadang.ac.id, ananda.azwar4127@gmail.com^b, gistituatinurhizrah@gmail.com^c, rusdinal@fip.unp.ac.id^d

^aUniversitas Ekasakti, Padang, West Sumatera

^{b c d}Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang, West Sumatera

Abstract

Education is the main capital in the progress of the life of the nation and state. Although Germany was in a period of devastation due to World War II, the German education system was more advanced than the Indonesian education system. This comparative study needs to be done to motivate policy makers and policy implementers to develop a better Indonesian education system. This study was conducted to describe the German and Indonesian education systems. The use of the method is carried out by literature study with ten national journal review results based on the German and Indonesian education systems. The results showed that there are differences in education at the level of higher education and financing between Germany and Indonesia. The German government provides a policy to be free in choosing majors at the higher education level because it makes it easier for them to get job opportunities after finishing college, while the Indonesian education system at the higher education level has no freedom of choice because it is bound by policies that regulate the taking of majors based on test scores obtained. Education financing in Germany is free from primary to higher education level. On the contrary, education financing in Indonesia charges fees starting from the elementary level to the higher education level except tuition fees (education financing donations are free for public schools starting from the elementary level to the higher education level).

Keywords: education system, Germany, Indonesia

1. Introduction

Education can create human civilization in order to form an education system that is considered as something that must exist for the progress of the life of the nation and state. Through this conformity, every society has values, states and symbols. However, differences in economic, social and cultural aspects in each country, as well as political circumstances make a difference in the results obtained. As a result, the education system that is applied in society in fulfilling high aspirations is a study that deserves to be raised against a comparison of the education system that is currently in effect (Mukhlis, 2020).

This comparative study was conducted to see the basic situation. This can be seen in the history of boycotting schools by the Roman Catholic Church by recognizing the exclusive right to read. The situation changed over time after the reformation, the church's monopoly on education was no longer recognized. Countries free from colonialism have the right to freedom of religion. A number of countries, particularly

Germany, have introduced improvements to their national education systems whose results are highly expected so that developments occur and are followed by other countries.

This comparative study is based on human resource development complemented by the ideas and experiences of others. The development of science and technology education motivates students in the development of the education system. Education can leave a mindset that is not free, where educational policy makers focus on the education system itself. If there is increased awareness of mindset, educational risks can lead to changes for the better. Therefore, this paper deserves to be appointed to describe the concept of German and Indonesian education in order to compare and improve the quality of Indonesian education.

The selection of the education system in Germany has developed rapidly. Judging from the education system, Germany is a country that has an education system that is recognized by the world. Since the 1970s, the German education system has been able to achieve educational goals designed for 25 years, especially after World War II, Germany suffered defeat. The success of the German education system was able to provide solutions to educational problems after accepting the defeat of World War II (Sunusi, 2020)..

2. Methodology

The method used in this study is a literature study with meta-analysis to examine ten articles in national journals. Then the analysis was carried out in stages, such as (1) the process of identifying using the Google search engine by selecting research with the same theme as this research in ten articles in national journals; (2) each journal is grouped according to research indicators, namely a comparison of the German and Indonesian education systems; (3) each journal is reviewed through comparative indicators of the German and Indonesian education systems; (4) each discussion result in the journal is associated with the application in the discussion and conclusions in the journal; (5) the results of the discussion are explained to differentiate this research (Moher et al., 2010); (Argaheni, 2020) (Moher et al., 2010); (Rosyada & Retnawati, 2022),

3. Result and Discussion

3.1 German Education System on Political Aspects and Educational Objectives

Since Germany's defeat in World War II, society has jointly created an education system that is free from repeating the same mistakes, namely the separation of powers including the education sector. This applies to every educational institution. This was made because it was considered that Hitler's influence on Germany led to its destruction. Education refers to growing a great desire to increase the professionalism needed to build a solid nation. Despite Germany being divided into two parts for a long time, the discourse of unity became important in German education.

Initially, German education had an impact on institutions, such as the state and religion. On the other hand, part of the state recognizes the authority to set up the education system. In line with the introduction of learning obligations in the 17th century, educational issues began to change into state obligations. Basic legislation can guarantee the right of everyone to get freedom in personality development and selection of schools, vocational education and jobs relevant to skills. Based on the observance of the German federal state, education is divided into federations and states. The state in particular has responsibility for public schools, locations, and children (Suyadi, 2020).

3.2 Structure and Types of Elementary, Secondary, and Higher Education

Education in Germany at the basic level applies at the age of 3-6 years. Education is known as *vorhuliche Einrichtungen* which is defined as preparation before education. The concept of basic education (*Kindergarten*) imitates many other countries. Therefore, the school level in a number of countries was adopted in Germany to be *kindergarden*. The organization of *kindergartens* comes from churches, social

organizations, sometimes in the form of companies and associations (Humairok GL & Widyastono Herry, 2020).

After Kindergarten, basic education is continued at the age of 7 years to 10 years. This education is called the *grundschule* which is defined as elementary school. From the *grundschule*, individuals have 4 choices in continuing their studies. *Hauptschule* is at a level of 5 to 9/10. *Realschule* (grade 5-10), *gesamtschule* (grade 5-13), and *gymnasium* (grade 5-13). At this stage, the child's abilities can determine the next child's goals. *Hauptschule* and *realschule* are focused on children who want to be able to work after finishing school. After completing education, having a *ffsfachschule* is useful in continuing on to higher education, while the fastest way is to take the *Gymnasium* route.

The degrees obtained from German and Indonesian universities have similarities, but the names of each level are different. Diploma majors are graduates who are equated with masters in Indonesia, and can continue to the doctoral program (Ph.D). it is stated that in Indonesia it is equated with *Vordiplom* in Germany, but this can be leveled. In other words, undergraduate (S1) graduates in Indonesia can continue their studies in Germany, there are 3 probabilities of being followed, for example a diploma from Indonesia is the same as *Vordiplom* or semester 5. To obtain a diploma level, you are required to take all courses from semester 5 to obtaining a diploma degree; (2) diplomas from Indonesia can be equated to one level in semester 5. For diploma equivalents, it is mandatory to take an equivalency exam; (3) diplomas in Indonesia are equivalent to participating in doctoral programs. It can be stated that S1 graduates from Indonesia continue their studies in Germany, can take part in promotions (S3). In general, the areas of expertise and curricula from S1 to S3 do not deviate too far and get convenience called *anerkennung* (Saifullah, 2014).

In Germany, the main types of higher education such as *Fachhochschule* and *universitat* (FH) have similarities in Indonesia, such as educational institutions that focus on application which in theory can be compared through its application. *Fachhochschule* studies cannot earn a doctorate degree, but are aimed at the industrial sector. Another type of higher education is *Musikhochschule* (music field). Another type of higher education is *hochschule* music, education that has similarities with the Institute of Teaching and Education and the institute of arts. The university system in Germany is different from Indonesia, it does not have guidelines in semesters, it has the arrangement of courses A, B, C and so on. It is defined that students are required to be able to make their own choices, lectures, exercises, seminars, next exams and so on. This can be given freedom, but it can make students in a state that is too relaxed so that most students find it difficult to get out of this problem. Students are required to have independence in making the desired choice of major. Sometimes lectures are held in large rooms that can accommodate 600 students. Lectures are conducted in German, although a number of universities in Germany use English.

The types of lectures are arranged based on *vorlesung* (lectures), seminars (discussions in the form of small groups), and *ubung* (practice). The exam is carried out by the tutor of the course. The average exam is carried out orally even though there are several courses given in writing. The examination system has various types so that it is permitted to take the same course the following year. The international system is regulated and has similarities with Indonesian lectures, for example lectures, practicals, and so on. In accordance with the two higher institutions is better and in accordance with the achievements as if. The average lecture in Germany is in demand in the industrial sector because it has development and research. This is difficult to find in Indonesia because the Indonesian education system is not free to choose which majors you are interested in because it is determined by the examination system and the exam results obtained. However, Germany has a uniqueness that adheres to a free system that can choose based on interests and job opportunities that are obtained after completing college so that salary expectations and jobs are good and obtained easily.

3.3 The Education Management

Germany gives authority in the education system. The implementation of this policy gains authority from the state government in determining education system policies. To regulate educational issues formulated through legislative institutions in the state. At present the German state has a different education system, such as the difference in the period of education. This state of affairs was motivated by the states' adoption and national enactment in 1969 and authority in educational matters was centralized to the federal government.

Education funding is borne by the state budget and the participation of local communities. The split includes operational financing borne by the state and infrastructure including the community. In this case, the federal government is responsible for financing higher education institutions so that institutions are free from financing so that tuition fees in Germany are relatively low (Isri, 2015).

3.4 The Education curriculum

The state ministry of education determines the curriculum that is relevant to the legislation in force in Germany with the type of instrument, such as (a) the breakdown of learning hours in each week and the level, as well as the type of school; (b) curriculum reference; (c) authority over the writing and procurement of textbooks. In general, the education curriculum in Germany is formulated by schools, but with the condition that (a) specific objectives are contained in the curriculum reference; (b) the syllabus and learning strategies are determined by the state ministries; (c) the learning text is used with notes recorded in a valid book recommendation; (d) learning methods that are open instruction.

3.4 Educational Evaluation and Research

The German education system does not apply educational evaluations and results like Indonesia, but evaluations are carried out on commissions/committees. There are a number of evaluations of children's achievement in school, but a diagnostic need is identified only in the type of child with special needs, for example dyslexia (learning difficulties caused by brain disorders). This approach is used for student achievement which refers to the teacher during learning. Reporting progress results can be in the form of tests that do not have legality. The scoring coefficient is guided by student participation in class. Because the evaluation steps vary, student assessment refers to personal assignments. A number of countries in Germany determine their own code. To obtain a diploma after completing studies at *Hauptchule* and *Realchule*, that is only by preparing for the final exam at the *Gymnasium* by obtaining approval from the minister (Putro et al., 2020).

3.5 The differences between the German Educational System and the Indonesian Educational System

Education relates to aspects that are influenced by the development of external aspects and internal aspects. The aspect that has competence and implications for changing the education system is ideology. Ideology put forward by Huber (1998) is something that is influenced by people's behavior in the cultural system. Ideology is reflected on the basis of judgments that are considered to be a reference in acting and communicating with others. There are other factors that are influenced by education policy, such as the study of education in foreign areas which refers to the management of the education system and the quality of teachers.

3.6 Philosophical Foundation and Educational System Policy

Philosophy used in a society is influenced by education and society itself so that the educational curriculum is reflected through the philosophy and beliefs of that society. In other words, the composition of the curriculum relates to three areas of philosophy, namely ontology which deals with the nature of life, epistemology which discusses knowledge and axiology which relates to judgment. Germany during the time of Hitler introduced fascist rationalization which was the cornerstone of the German education system at that time. Education refers to the formation of human character in various aspects, such as aspects of knowledge and natural findings, especially the benefits of German military strength, such as sports that are carried out to develop world boxing champions.

After Germany's defeat in World War II and the unification of West Germany and East Germany, Germany reformulated the philosophical concepts that were used as a reference in the life of the nation and state. The German nation considered unity, division of power. Philosophical rebuilding was necessary in a period of German revival. This opinion influences the philosophical existentialism which focuses on one's own abilities, the philosophical progressivism with progressivism which contains science, and influences the philosophical critical pedagogy in trying to reformulate the destruction of the Nazi ideology. Many philosophical concepts in Germany adhere to the federal system. In this system, the state has the authority to have its own education system. This is due to the fact that the educational period in a number of countries is different from others (Laksana, 2021).

The influence of changes in the philosophical foundations of education has an impact on the liberal government policies of the state government in the field of education. The following are some of German education policies

- (a) The German government considers that education plays a role in causing the destruction of the German economy and ideology. For this reason, the government is making efforts to ensure the attainment of education for all German people from the elementary level to the higher education level.
- (b) The government is not fully authorized to regulate education. Educational authority is held by the state.
- (c) The community is involved in building the success of the education system.
- (d) The reunification of West Germany and East Germany resulted in an improvement in the education system. Therefore, the government seeks to provide justice to the two unified areas of Germany by allocating the state budget for education.
- (e) The German government focuses on teacher qualifications. It is difficult for teachers in Germany to become doctors. The relationship between teaching quality and teacher welfare was taken over by German government policy.

3.7 Indonesian Educational System

Education in Indonesia is designed in a structured and unstructured manner. In a structured manner, Indonesian education is given authority to the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia (Kemendikbud), formerly known as the Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Indonesia (Depdiknas). In Indonesia, all residents are required to participate in compulsory basic education for nine years and six years in primary school, and the following three years in secondary school. Education in Indonesia refers to Law no. 20 of 2003 concerning the national education system. Education in Indonesia is divided into three main channels, namely formal, non-formal and informal. Education is divided into four levels, namely early childhood, elementary, middle, and high (Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System, 2003).

The level of pre-school education is referred to in law number 20 of 2003 concerning the national education system. Pre-school education (PAUD) is an effort made to nurture newborn children up to the age of six in order to provide educational stimulation in supporting physical and spiritual improvement so that children have preparation for entering further education. The age of early childhood education includes 1 to 5 years. Basic education is education that is obtained for 9 (nine) years, namely elementary school (SD) for 6 years and junior high school (SMP) for 3 years. This basic education is an activity that is mandatory for all Indonesian children to learn. The age of children entering primary school starts from the age of 6 years to 11 years, while junior high school is held at the age of 11 to 14 years. Next, secondary education is obtained from the completion of junior high school. Senior high school (SMA) or vocational high school (SMK) is

completed for 3 years of education. The age of children entering this education is 14 years to 17 years. While higher education is the level of education which includes diploma, bachelor, master, doctoral, and specialist education carried out by universities. For the length of education that must be completed by each level, namely undergraduate is completed for 4 years, master is completed for 2 years, and doctoral is completed for 3 years (Jannah, 2017).

The types of education are divided into five, they are (1) academic education, namely undergraduate and postgraduate higher education which is guided in mastering certain knowledge; (2) professional education is higher education at the undergraduate level which is prepared to become a professional; (3) vocational education is prepared to have competence at the diploma level 4 which is the same as the undergraduate level; (4) religious education is education prepared by the teacher for students to gain knowledge and practice in religious teaching; and (5) special education is education for children with special needs that is carried out in an inclusive manner that can be equated with education units at the primary, secondary levels (in the form of special schools).

The curriculum in Indonesia is different from other countries. During the colonial period, the curriculum in Indonesia was implemented by the Dutch and Japanese governments. The Dutch created a curriculum based on political interests in making it easier for the Dutch to trade with indigenous Indonesians and spread Christianity in Indonesia. Reading and writing are taught to Indonesian citizens so they can help in trading. When Japan colonized Indonesia, the curriculum in Indonesia was changed and adapted to Japanese interests. Indonesia's education curriculum has changed 11 eleven times. Since 1947 the Indonesian curriculum was designed by the Dutch which is called the *leerplan* (study plan). Pancasila is the foundation specified in the Indonesian curriculum. The nature of education in the Indonesian curriculum is political because of the transition period from Dutch education to Indonesian education.

In 1947, the curriculum in Indonesia focused on building character. Learning emphasizes personality and awareness in belonging to the state and society. Learning material is obtained from everyday life related to it. Physical and arts education is a concern in this curriculum. Next, the 1952 curriculum was refined from the 1947 curriculum, known as the 1947 lesson plan. Each learning material was formulated in detail when compared to the previous curriculum. Changes to the previous curriculum occurred in one teacher teaching one learning material. The lesson plan outlined in 1952 was reflected in the national education system, and was no longer diverted from the 1947 lesson plan. In the 1964 lesson plan, learning in elementary schools focused on the pancawardhana program. Pancawardhana is a program whose scope includes skills, physical, emotional or artistic, intelligence, and personality. The government formulated the program in the 1964 curriculum so that every citizen would obtain good academic knowledge so that the curriculum could be perfected from the previous curriculum (Nasution, 2014).

In 1969, Indonesia entered the New Order era. The 1964 curriculum was the result of the old order which was changed to the 1968 curriculum. The 1968 curriculum aimed to build *Pancasila* people, namely healthy strengths that can increase intelligence and physical skills, morals, morals, and beliefs. The 1968 curriculum material is theoretical, not related to problems that occur in everyday life. Learning activities are focused on the level of education in order to develop skills and intelligence, and make children physically strong and healthy (Alhamuddin, 2014).

MBO (management by objective) is a foundation in the field of management which has an impact on the emergence of the 1975 curriculum. This curriculum is carried out so that education becomes more effective and efficient. Maeri, learning methods and objectives are summarized into an instructional system development procedure (PPSI). This curriculum is also called the learning unit, namely the learning plan for each subject unit. Each unit of discussion is explained in the form of general instructional objectives (TIU), specific instructional objectives (ICT), use of learning media, learning materials, learning activities, assessment of learning outcomes. There are many elements in the curriculum, such as teachers are required to

have competence in writing down the most important things and lists that are achieved from each learning activity.

The 1984 curriculum was a refinement of the 1975 curriculum, often referred to as the 1975 curriculum. The 1975 curriculum focused on a process-expertise approach. Even so, there is a goal that is the most important aspect. This curriculum refers to the Active Student Learning Method (CBSA) learning model. This model is used in world education known as SAL (student active learning). This model was pioneered by Professor Dr. Conny R, Semiawan who served as Head of the Curriculum Center for the Ministry of National Education from 1980 to 1986. In CBSA, student status functioned as learning subjects so that students had assignments and learning activities, such as discussions, in groups, and conveying the results of their learning. This foundation was tried out in a number of schools and obtained satisfactory results. However, the difference that appears in the use of this model is that the teacher no longer teaches in front of the class.

Next, the 1994 curriculum was refined from the 1984 curriculum. This curriculum refers to law no. 2 of 1989 on the national education system. The striking change is in the semester system to quarterly. This curriculum has competency outcomes that are considered important in the success of learning. The special features of the 2004 curriculum are learning activities that use a variety of strategies so that students don't get bored in class; (2) learning resources do not only come from teachers, but can come from anywhere, in other words they still have an educational element; (3) curriculum achievement is student competence, individual or classical which is oriented to variations in learning outcomes; (4) learning evaluation focuses on competency achievement. Knowledge and skills in each study are grouped on the subject aspects of learning; (5) the basic aspects of KBK are based on class elements, semester aspects.

Next, KTSP is designed so that national education relates to each region, regional conditions, educational units and students. In KTSP, the government sets competency standards and basic competencies. Meanwhile, teachers in each school develop a syllabus and assessments that are adapted to the conditions of the school. The KTSP is designed by the responsible school under the guidance of the local regional education office. Then this curriculum was declared less successful and discontinued in 2012. There are four points in the assessment of this curriculum, namely attitude, behavior, competency, and knowledge (Yamin, 2008).

The 2013 curriculum has additional material, namely mathematics and a number of simplified materials, such as Indonesian, PPKN, social studies, and so on. Learning Science and Mathematics is raised to international standards (TIMSS and PISA). This is done to balance Indonesian education with other countries (Mulyasa, 2014).

Indonesian education management standards refer to Government Regulation no. 19 of 2005 (2) states that education standards are refined based on planning and developing according to the needs of the life of citizens as a whole. Further explained in Government Regulation no. 32 of 2013 concerning national education standards. This standard contains content standards, process standards, graduate competency standards, educator and educational staff standards, facilities and infrastructure standards, management standards, financing standards, and education assessment standards.

The management of education units in primary and secondary education applies school-based management which has elements of independence, partnership, participation, openness and accountability. The management of higher education units implements higher education autonomy regulated in legislation which gives freedom in academic management. Each educational unit is governed by and refers to the curriculum, academic calendar, organizational structure of the educational unit, rules of conduct for the educational unit covering education, educational personnel, maintenance of facilities and infrastructure, code of ethics of the educational unit and society, and operational financing of the educational unit; (3) each educational unit is managed on the basis of an annual work plan in the medium term of 4 years; (4) primary and secondary education levels that consider school committees; (5) management of educational units is carried out in an independent, efficient, effective and accountable manner; (6) supervision of educational units includes

supervision, assessment, reporting, follow-up on the results of supervision; (7) supervision carried out by the school committee; (8) the results of supervision are followed up by reports on the results of supervision in order to improve the quality of education units; (9) preparation of an annual work plan in the field of education focusing on (a) compulsory education; (b) participation in secondary and tertiary education; (c) eradication of illiteracy; (d) quality assurance in educational units carried out by the government and society; (e) increasing the professional status of teachers and lecturers; (f) educational standards; (g) educational accreditation; (h) increasing education according to local needs; (i) fulfillment of minimum education service standards; (j) national education quality assurance; (k) implementation of secondary and basic and higher education is increased by education units at the international level. (Sunusi, 2020)

4. Conclusion

The results of the study show that there are significant differences in the German and Indonesian education systems, especially at the higher education level, students have the freedom to choose majors according to their interests and talents and then have the opportunity to work after graduating from university. Likewise, funding starting from the elementary level up to the higher education level is taken free of charge from the state government budget except for food costs. Meanwhile, the Indonesian education system does not have freedom of choice because it is bound by policies governing majors based on test scores obtained. Furthermore, financing is also not free for every Indonesian students.

References

- Clark, T., Woodley, R., De Halas, D., 1962. Gas-Graphite Systems, in "Nuclear Graphite" R. Nightingale, Editor. Academic Press, New York, p. 387.
- Deal, B., Grove, A., 1965. General Relationship for the Thermal Oxidation of Silicon, Journal of Applied Physics 36, p. 3770.
- Deep-Burn Project: Annual Report for 2009, Idaho National Laboratory, Sept. 2009.
- Fachinger, J., den Exter, M., Grambow, B., Holgerson, S., Landesmann, C., Titov, M., Podruzhina, T., 2004. "Behavior of spent HTR fuel elements in aquatic phases of repository host rock formations," 2nd International Topical Meeting on High Temperature Reactor Technology. Beijing, China, paper #B08.
- Fachinger, J., 2006. Behavior of HTR Fuel Elements in Aquatic Phases of Repository Host Rock Formations. Nuclear Engineering & Design 236, p. 54
- Alhamuddin. 2014. Sejarah Kurikulum di Indonesia. *Nur El-Islam*, 1(2), p.48–58.
- Argaheni, B. N. 2020. Sistemik Review: Dampak Perkuliahan Daring saat Pandemi Covid-19 terhadap Mahasiswa Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmiah Kesehatan Dan Aplikasinya: PLACENTUM*, 8(2), p. 99–108.
- Humairok GL, U., & Widyastono Herry. 2020. Analisis Perbandingan Teknologi Pendidikan Anak Berkebutuhan Khusus di Negara Indonesia dan Negara-Negara Eropa (Finlandia, Jerman, Inggris, Belanda). *Best Journal (Biology Education Science and Technology)*, 3(1), p.32–38.
- Isri, S. 2015. Konsep Pendidikan Jerman dan Australia; Kajian Komparatif dan Aplikatif terhadap Mutu Pendidikan Indonesia. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 4(1), p/25. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpi.2015.41.25-47>
- Jannah, H. 2017. Pengembangan Kurikulum (Teori dan Praktik). In *Kurikulum 2013* p. 1–388. Pustaka Nurja.
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No.20 Tahun 2003 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional, Pub. L. No. 20, Sekretaris Negeri Republik Indonesia 1 (2003).
- Laksana, S. I. 2021. *Penguatan Hubungan Bilateral Indonesia-Jerman dalam Deklarasi Jakarta 2012 dan Pengaruhnya terhadap Pengembangan Pendidikan Vokasi di Indonesia*. Universitas Pasundan.
- Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J., & Altman, D. G. 2010. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: The PRISMA statement. *International Journal of Surgery*, 8(5).p.336–341. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijsu.2010.02.007>
- Mukhlis. 2020. Studi Komparatif Pendidikan dan Bahasa Indonesia-Jerman di Era Global. *Prosiding Seminar Literasi V*, p.785–798.
- Mulyasa, H. E. 2014. *Pengembangan dan Implementasi Kurikulum 2013* (S. A. Wardan, Ed.; 4th ed.). Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Nasution. 2014. *Asas-Asas Kurikulum*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Putro, T. S., Widyastuti, M., & Hastuti. 2020. Problematika pembelajaran di era pandemi covid-19 studi kasus: Indonesia, Filipina, Nigeria, Ethiopia, Finlandia, dan Jerman. *Geomedia: Majalah Ilmiah Dan Informasi Kegeografian*, 18(2), p.50–64.
- Rosyada, N. M., & Retnawati, H. 2022. Elementary school: A review of evaluation elementary school: A review of evaluations. *AIP Conference Proceedings*.p.1–9.

- Saifullah. 2014. Konsep Pendidikan Jerman dan Australia (Kajian Komparatif dan Aplikatif terhadap Mutu Pendidikan Indonesia). *JIP (International Multidisciplinary Journal)*, II(2), p.261–286.
- Sunusi, S. 2020. Tinjauan Sistem Pendidikan Sekolah Kerja, Pendidikan di Jerman, dan Pendidikan di Cina. *VENUS*, 8(1), p.20–39.
- Suyadi. 2020. Menelisik Konsep Pendidikan Jerman dan Australia sebagai Benchmarking Pendidikan di Indonesia. *Jurnal Elkatarie*, 3(2), p.420–438.
- Yamin, M. 2008. *Profesionalisasi Guru & Implementasi KTSP*. Gaung Persada Press.